

Deputy Carol Nolan Leinster House Kildare Street Dublin 2

23 September 2020

RE: Private Member's Bill to legislate for Assisted Suicide in Ireland

Dear Deputy,

We write to you as individual specialist medical practitioners and members of the Irish Palliative Medicine Consultants' Association (IPMCA), to voice our serious concerns regarding the proposal to remove the existing legislative safeguards that protect our citizens in respect of assisted suicide and euthanasia.

Key points:

- 1. We are opposed to any form of legislation for assisted dying, assisted suicide or euthanasia in Ireland;
- 2. Compassion, advocacy and support are at the heart of the palliative care that is delivered across Ireland to those who are suffering as a result of advanced illness;
- 3. The intended and inevitable unintended consequences of the proposed legislation are stark and unthinkable;
- 4. There should be no role for medical practitioners in deciding eligibility for, or in the delivery of, any form of assisted suicide or euthanasia in Ireland.

Based on our collective experience, earned through thousands of care interventions for patients and their families annually, we strongly oppose any proposed changes to the current legislative status quo on the grounds that:

- By virtue of our caring for many patients and their families we have a keen awareness
 of the suffering experienced by some people. Harnessing this awareness, and with a
 spirit of deep care, support of and advocacy for our patients, we know that even the
 severe physical or psychological distress experienced by a minority can be managed to
 their satisfaction;
- The proposed bill is deeply flawed in several aspects including, most shockingly, that both assisted suicide and euthanasia be permissible;
- Based on international evidence there are no safeguards that can be put in place that will meaningfully restrict the use and misuse of such legislation:



- The High Court ruling in the Marie Fleming case was very clear in this regard: Even with the most rigorous systems of legislative checks and safeguards, it would be impossible to ensure that the aged, the disabled, the poor, the unwanted, the rejected, the lonely, the impulsive, the financially compromised and emotionally vulnerable would not avail of this option to avoid a sense of being a burden to their family and society'
- International evidence tells us that legislation intended to allow for the killing of adults suffering pain as a result of advanced illness has resulted in the killing of adults with no life-limiting illness, those who have untreated mental health issues, those with dementia, those who are blind, deaf or merely 'tired of life' and in the killing of infants and children
- The proposed legislation will completely alter the traditional doctor—patient relationship, where each party is assured that the doctor will always strive to do the most positive good and will refrain from causing harm;
- It is incongruous to us that while significant health & social care resources are invested
 to try to prevent, and support those left behind by, the over 400 suicides by citizens of
 our country each year, this Bill proposes a mechanism by which the state would support
 citizens to actively end their own lives or legalise that others might deliberately kill
 them.

In particular, we would like to bring to your attention the significant harms that the decriminalisation of assisted suicide would likely have on the most vulnerable in society, as well as on healthcare professionals, patients and their families. We believe that assisted suicide would represent an irreversible, regressive change in healthcare policy in Ireland.

We would welcome the opportunity to share our practical understanding of this difficult issue and to elaborate on our concerns regarding the proposed legislation. Please feel free to contact Dr. Feargal Twomey or any of the undersigned.

Yours sincerely,

Feargal Twomey, MB, FRCPI, MRCP(Lond)

Consultant Physician in Palliative Medicine, UL Hospitals Group and Milford Care Centre, Limerick A/Chairperson of the Irish Palliative Medicine Consultants' Association

E: f.twomey@milfordcc.ie

Tony O'Brien

Prof Tony O'Brien MB FRCPI

Clinical Professor of Palliative Medicine, College of Medicine & Health, University College Cork



Marie Twomey

Dr Marie Twomey MB FRCPI

Consultant in Palliative Medicine, St Luke's Radiation Oncology Network

E: marie.twomey@slh.ie | St Luke's Hospital, Highfield Road, Rathgar, Dublin 6 D06E1C9

Nome O' Leary

Dr. Norma O'Leary, MB, MRCPI, MD

Consultant Physician in Palliative Medicine, Our Lady's Hospice & Care Services and St. James's Hospital

Valerie O Relling

Dr Val O'Reilly MB MRCPI MRCGP

Consultant in Palliative Medicine, UL Hospital Group & Milford Hospice Limerick

Professor Karen Ryan

Karen Lyan

UCD Clinical Professor, Consultant in Palliative Medicine

UCD School of Medicine, Mater Misericordiae University Hospital and St Francis Hospice

Dr. Denise Hayes MB MRCPI MRCP(UK) MRCGP MSc.

Consultant in Palliative Medicine (HSE SE), University Hospital Waterford

E: Denisem.hayes@hse.ie

Faith Cranfield MB BAO BCh MRCPI MSc

Consultant in Palliative Medicine, St Francis Hospice Blanchardstown and Connolly Hospital

Maxian Cours

Marian Conroy MB, FRCP

Consultant Physician in Palliative Medicine, UL Hospitals Group and Milford Care Centre, Limerick

E: m.conroy@milfordcc.ie

Dr Mags Clifford

Consultant in Palliative Medicine

Cork Kerry Community Healthcare | Health Service Executive |

Kerry Specialist Palliative Care Services | University Hospital Kerry



Conny-Ros

Dr. Cathryn Bogan MB BCh BAO BA MRCPI Consultant in Palliative Medicine North West Hospice / Sligo University Hospital

1... 05

Dr Aisling O'Gorman, MB BCh BAO MRCPI DME PGDip HPE Consultant Physician in Palliative Medicine Honorary Clinical Senior Lecturer, Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland Louth & Meath Specialist Palliative Care Services, Dóchas Centre, Our Lady of Lourdes Hospital Drogheda

clare mcaleer

Dr Clare McAleer MB BCh BAO Consultant in Palliative Medicine Beaumont Hospital and St Francis Hospice Raheny

Bour

Dr Barbara Sheehy-Skeffington MB BAO BCh MRCPI Locum Consultant in Palliative Medicine Our Lady's Hospice and Care Services and St James's Hospital, Dublin

E: bskeffington@olh.ie

Torold Stars

Dr. Bernadette Brady MB BAO BCh MRCPI MSc Consultant in Palliative Medicine, Tallaght University Hospital

De Eleen Mannison

Dr. Eileen Mannion MD, MRCPI
Clinical Lecturer in Palliative Medicine, NUIG
Consultant in Palliative Medicine, Galway University Hospital & Roscommon

Sheren Seatty

Clinical Lecturer in Palliative Medicine, NUIG

Consultant in Palliative Medicine, Galway University Hospital & Portiuncula University Hospitals

Dr Maeve O'Reilly MB, FRCPI

Consultant in Palliative Medicine, St Luke's Hospital, Dublin

E: maeve.oreilly@slh.ie

D Ucango Relp

Dr. Karen Dennehy, Locum Consultant in Palliative Medicine, Kildare



Miniam aller

Dr Miriam Colleran MB BCh BAO MRCGP MD
Consultant in Palliative Medicine St Brigid's Hospice & Naas General Hospital, Kildare

Earle Walle Consultant Physician in Palliative Media

Consultant Physician in Palliative Medicine, Our Lady of Lourdes Hospital, Drogheda, Co. Louth

About the IPMCA: The Irish Palliative Medicine Consultants' Association (IPMCA) is the official association for Consultants in Palliative Medicine in the Republic of Ireland. The aims of the Association are to:

- Promote the appropriate development of specialist palliative care services in the Republic of Ireland and to provide medical leadership to these services;
- Promote medical education and research appropriate to palliative medicine;
- Act as the formal representative body for consultants in palliative medicine in the Republic of Ireland; and
- Provide a supportive and advisory forum for new and existing consultants in palliative medicine in the Republic of Ireland